

JIM ALLAN.

Neil McLeod's effortd with Elvish verse interested me very much. In his English version of the complete Elvish hymn I did not much like his rhymes with zenith - the stress is wrong and so is the vowel sound - but I must admit that I can't come up with anything better in a translation preserving both the rhyme scheme and metre of the original, so I can't really complain.

In respect to the poems in Quenya I have, however, some complaints, or better, suggestions. I am setting them forth in the hope of eliciting further comment, and also with a great deal of admiration for Neil for even attempting to compose directly in Quenya. I will put Neil's verse and my own suggested changes side by side, underscoring those places where I would change Neil's rendering. First, the Quenya translation of 'A Elbereth":

Ai Elentari Ai Varda!	Ai Varda! Ai Tintallë!
Vemiri sila undlanta	ve miri silmëa undulanta
alcar eleni menello	menello alcar i elenion
Ar si itiran palanna	Palandenna itiren
Aldar quantwa endorillo	aldarembin endorellon
linivan lyenna Tintalle	Oiolossëo Fana lin linduvan
Ai si pella aneare	ëar pella, sinome ëaren pella

Since Varda is the regular Quenya name for the being usually called Elbereth in Sindarin, I have used it first, instead of Elentári, and then for Sindarin Gilthoniel 'star-kindler' I have used the Quenya Tintallë. There is no reason to believe that the preposition ve can be prefixed to the following word, hence my ve miri. According to Tokien Silivren contains the Quenya name Silima (The Road goes Ever On, p. 65) - in Sindarin original m becomes v following a vowel - and so I have invented a Quenya form silmëa (silima+ëa) as a possible Quenya counterpart. Another choice might be silimin. The unin Quenya untupa (found in Namárië) must derive from the earlier root ndú 'down', and so I think, ahould be considered a compound of und+tupa. I would prefer not to use a form like undlanta since the combination ndl is not found anywhere in the extant Quenya. Instead I have used undulanta on the pattern of undulave in 'Namarie'. In the third line I have changed Neil's word order to that of the Sindarin poem. In the original Sindarin the form elenath is a collective plural and is genetival in meaning since it is placed after another noun. The closest we can get to indicating the collective æpert in Quenya is using the definite article i 'the'. In the Sindarin the idea is that 'there streams down' is not just the glory of stars in general, but the glory of the stars, all the stars. The genitive plural forn elenion is required rather than the simple plural form eleni.

an panc pigrag

CLARCY AGADC 12: PECKADA

Neil's form <u>quantwa</u> is wrong on several counts. First, the noun and adjective ending <u>-wa</u> is used only following <u>n</u> or <u>ng</u> (or following <u>q</u> in the form <u>ua</u>), and elsewhere has the form <u>-ma</u>. Second, the form must be plural. So <u>quantmar</u> would be possible, but for the closer translation of the Sindarin <u>galadhrenmin</u> I have created an adjective <u>rembin</u> from Quenya <u>rembe</u>, which is the exact cognate of the Sindarin <u>rem</u> 'mesh', (III, p. 393). (Some printings of the LOTR have the misspelling <u>rembre</u>.) Another possible construction would be <u>rembië</u>. Forms with the case endings <u>-sse</u> and <u>-llo</u> pluralize by adding <u>n</u>, hence the correct plural of a form <u>endorello</u> is <u>endorellon</u> rather than <u>endorillo</u>. My source for this information is Dick Plotz, who received it from Tolkien, the only indication of this rule in the published material being the form <u>yassen</u>.

As a good literal translation of Sindarin <u>Fanuilos</u> I have used <u>Oiolossëo Fana</u>. For <u>le</u> 'to you' we want a Quenya form with a dative meaning, not an allitive one, so the suffix <u>-nna</u> won't do. In 'Namarië' we find the dative <u>nin</u> 'for me'. Accordingly, Bill Welden has suggested in an article 'On Pronouns in Quenya' (PARMA ELDALAMBERON 3, p.15f), that a reasonable form for the second person singular dative pronoun is <u>lin</u>. In Sindarin the stem 'sing' or 'song' is <u>Linn</u> as in <u>linnathon</u> 'I will sing' and <u>aerlinn</u> 'hymn', so the Quenya form must be either <u>linn</u> or <u>lind</u>. That it is <u>lind</u> is indicated by Treebeard's short verse, <u>Laurelindórenan lindelorendor</u> malinorélion ornemalin, which I would break down as <u>Laure</u> 'gold'; <u>lind</u> 'song'; <u>-doré</u> 'land'; <u>nan</u> 'valley'; <u>linde</u> 'singing'; <u>loren</u> 'golden' or 'dreaming'; <u>-dor</u> 'land'; <u>malin</u> 'golden'; <u>ornélion</u> 'of many trees'; <u>orne</u> 'tree'; <u>malin</u> 'golden'. Hence my form <u>Linduvan</u> instead of <u>linuvan</u>.

The word <u>pella</u> rightly follows the word to which it refers. In Quenya si is recorded only with the meaning 'now', not 'here', as in Sindarin. It might mean both, but to be safe I have used instead <u>sinome</u> 'in this place'. For 'great sea' the proper Quenya form is <u>earen</u> as in <u>Earenya</u> 'sea day', rendered in Sindarin <u>Oraearon</u>. So I have used it. If a compound such as Neil proposes is to be used it should be either and<u>ear</u> or <u>and<u>earen</u>, since the Quenya element for 'long, great' is <u>and</u> as in <u>Andave laituvalement</u> 'greatly we will praise (them) both'. This naturally becomes, in most places, <u>ann</u> in Sindarin as in <u>Cuio</u> <u>i Pheriain annan</u>! 'Long live the Halflings!' This shortens to <u>an</u> in most compounds as in <u>Anduin</u> 'Great River', but remains still as <u>and</u> before <u>r</u> as in <u>Cair Andros</u> 'Island (of) Long-foam'.</u>

So now for the first verse of Neil's own composition:

Si ilyë alcarlyo avaniëSi ilya alcar elya avaniëvemalta Eldaron isiliëve malta Eldaron isiliëValiëtinco pellallo anëarevalantinco ëaren pellalloelyë arnyë certamimbeelyë ar enyë imbecertar/imbercertalvësi ambar undulanta minnamorniësi ambar undilanta mornienna

The form <u>ilvë</u> is plural, hence I have constructed a singular form <u>ilya</u>. It is possible that neither will do, if the primary meaning of the singular is 'each' rather than 'all of'. The suffix <u>-lyo</u> is in the genitive case and therefore means 'of your'. For 'your glory' <u>alcarlya</u> might be possible, but I feel rather bothered by such a combination as <u>rly</u>, and have therefore used the free-standing form of the possessive pronoun suggested by Bill Welden. Again I give ve as a separate preposition, and give to <u>isilië</u> the proper long quality of the stem vowel. Neil's <u>valië</u> is a possible form, but since we don't know for sure that it actually can exist I have played safe by using <u>valan</u> which is actually found. For <u>Eären</u> and the placing of <u>pella</u> (in any form) after the word to which it applies, see above.



amaza. Daviera and

It is not clear that a compound like <u>arnyë</u> could occur, and I have therefore used a free-standing form of the pronoun ar. Tolkien gives us several verb forms which contain both the basic verb stem and an added adverbial or prepositional element: <u>enquantuva</u>, <u>ortanë</u>, <u>undulávë</u>, <u>untúpa</u>. In all these, the adverbial or prepositional element is prefixed, NOT suffixed, to the stem, hence I have placed <u>imbe</u> first rather than last. I have given two forms of the verb. One is a simple plural. In the second I have added a reconstructed form of the lst plural inclusive pronomial suffix as suggested by Bill Welden, on the basis of <u>-lvo</u> in <u>Elen sila lúmenn' omentielvo</u>. I think either form could be used here. Finally, I don't understand Neil's form <u>minnamornië</u> at all. So I use the quite regular mornienna. Finally, Neil's last verse:

Inentië vanallo andonya	Tiesse vaneasse andonyallo
nusilmë lassiyenion caitar	nu silmë yenion lassi caitar
lissëlasselantion inencala	lisse-lasselantaron altasse
Namárië oialë marde armar	Namarië oialë marde ar mar
tindomë hiruvanyë vanwa	tindome hiruvani vanwa.

To come up with inentië I presume Neil has taken the suffix of lirinen 'in song' and surinen 'in the wind' and prefixed it to tie, a most questionable procedure. I have, instead, simply put tie in the locative case by adding <u>-ssë</u>. For 'going' I have created a possible adjectival or participal form of the verb stem vani- and then let it agree with tiesse in number and case. The 'from' is indicated correctly by adding the ablative case ending -110 'from' to andonya 'my door' not to the adjective or participle used for 'going'. I have separated nu and silme-, there is no reason to run them together, added the long vowel indicator to yenion, and slightly changed the word order to the more normal I have hyphenated after lisse just as Tolkien does in lisse-miruvoreva conventions. to break up a very long compound. I have also corrected the plural genetive ending, since the plural genetive ending -on is applied to the regular plural of the word, which in this case would be Lasselantar . Compare aldaron. For 'in light' I have, as previously, put a word for 'light' in the locative case instead of incorrectly prefixing inen. The form calasse might also have been used.

In the second last line the joining of ar and mar is needless and I have therefore separated them.

In the last line I have restored the proper diacritic to the <u>o</u> in <u>tindomë</u>. I have also changed Neil's <u>hiruvanyë</u>, as <u>-nye</u> indicates the nominative case of the personal pronoun lst. s., that is 'I' as in <u>utuvienyes</u> 'I have found it'. Bill Welden (op. cit.) suggests that the <u>-n</u> found in other cases is just a reduced form of <u>-nye</u> which I think makes good sense. He tentatively proposes ni for 'me', the accusative case of the personal pronoun lst. s., and I have used this, suffixed to the verb. It may not be right for 'will find me', but <u>hiruvanyë</u> must mean 'I will find', and that is CERTAINLY not right.

My versions of the poems, though correct, or at least more likely to be correct, in grammar, rather destroy Neil's rhymes and, though less often, his metre. It might be possible to remedy this, indeed one change in the word order would correct it for my version of the last verse of Neil's poem, but this article has dragged on too long already. Perhaps at a future date ?

(The original poem as discussed in this article first appeared in the Mallorn, issue number 9, and was written by Neil McLeod.)

